

In Hilchos YOM TOV

You have heard the shaylos . . .
Now learn the issues & the opinions

Hoshana Rabba

A Day of Hidden Greatness

A summary of the weekly Wednesday night shiur by Rabbi Shmuel Stein at the Miami Beach Community Kollel / To receive a copy send an email to InHilchosShabbos@gmail.com

Sefer Avnei Yosef¹ writes, "Although the day of *Hoshana Rabba* may seem like an ordinary day [as it is permitted to perform melacha²], it is actually a day of hidden greatness, as it is a day (of judgment) when one can merit forgiveness for his sins."

The custom to eat Kreplach. Avnei Yosef³ adds that there is a custom to eat Kreplach (pieces of dough wrapped around a meat filling) three times a year: Purim, Erev Yom Kippur and *Hoshana Rabba*. I have heard that the reason for this is because all of these are days seem to be ordinary days [as it is permitted to perform melacha⁴] yet they are "hidden days" which are filled with greatness.⁵

In this chapter we will discuss the following two parts of this unique and hidden day:

Part One: The Final Part of the Judgment

Part Two: The Day of the Arava

Part 1: Hoshana Rabba - The Final Part of the Judgment

Yeshayah HaNavi⁶ writes [that Hashem says]: "The Jewish people seek Me (on the) 'day' 'day'." The Gemara Yerushalmi⁷ explains that these two 'days' are referring to Rosh HaShana and *Hoshana Rabba* when the Jewish people come to shul to seek out Hashem, as these are days of judgment.⁸ The Zohar⁹ writes this as well, "The seventh day of Sukkos [*Hoshana Rabba*] is the conclusion of the judgment of the entire world." Sefer Nigid u'Mitzvah¹⁰ writes, "there are three parts to the judgment: on Rosh HaShana, the judgment is written; on Neilah of Yom Kippur, it is signed; and on *Hoshana Rabba*, it is signed again and is handed over to the messenger to be sent out. (The judgment, however, is only sent out on the eighth day of Sukkos, *Shmini Atzeres*, as one can still do teshuva until that time to prevent the judgment from being sent out)." Machzor Vitri¹¹ writes as well, "On Yom Kippur the judgment is signed and on *Hoshana Rabba* it is fulfilled."

Understanding the judgment

Rav Yaakov Kamenetzky¹² explains that although one's judgment was already decreed and sealed on Yom Kippur, Hakadosh Baruch Hu in His Mercy gives us another opportunity to be victorious. We can understand this based on the rule which states that 'the Kingdom in Heaven operates similar to the kingdom on earth.' Just as a human king can grant a pardon or amnesty to a convicted person or group, so too, during the ten days between Yom Kippur and *Hoshana Rabba* one can merit to be granted a pardon or amnesty from Hakadosh Baruch Hu. This is the judgment of *Hoshana Rabba* – will one merit this pardon!¹³

Customs on Hoshana Rabba

The Shulchan Aruch and poskim discuss numerous customs which indicate that the day of *Hoshana Rabba* is indeed a day of judgment:

- ❖ The Shulchan Aruch¹⁴ writes that some have the custom of lighting additional candles on *Hoshana Rabba* just as is done on Yom Kippur. The Mishna Berura¹⁵ explains as just as Yom Kippur is a day of judgment, so is *Hoshana Rabba*.
- ❖ The Rema¹⁶ writes that some have the custom of wearing a kittel on *Hoshana Rabba* just as they do on Yom Kippur. The Mishna Berura¹⁷ writes however that the custom in our communities is that only the *shaliach tzibur* wears a kittel while the rest of the congregation wears their Shabbos clothing.¹⁸
- ❖ The Rema¹⁹ writes that those who are careful in halacha immerse themselves in the Mikva before *alos hashachar* just as is done on *erev Yom Kippur*. The Mishna Berura²⁰ writes however that it is preferable to immerse oneself before nightfall so that one can learn the entire night in holiness (as we will later discuss).
- ❖ The Aruch haShulchan²¹ writes that we recite *Shiur HaYichud* on *Hoshana Rabba* as we do on Yom Kippur, and the tunes one sings during davening should be the same as is done on Yom Kippur.
- ❖ The Rema²² writes that "There is a *siman* which is hidden in the shade of the moon on *Hoshana Rabba* night. If one looks at the shade of the moon on this night, he can determine what will occur to him or his family during the upcoming year."²³ Nevertheless, he concludes that "It is preferable not to look at these signs, but rather to follow Hashem with complete trust and sincerity." The Aruch haShulchan²⁴ adds that "Hashem forbade us to look at such things, for it is possible for a person does teshuva and in one moment the judgment can be switched from bad to good."

Sefer Nigid u'Mitzvah²⁵ writes that "on the day of *Hoshana Rabba* one should be very careful with his *tefillos* and all of his actions as the [judgment] is determined by this time." The Aruch haShulchan²⁶ writes that "When we circle around the bimah and recite *Hoshanos* it is done with much crying just as is done on Yom Kippur." [Maharam m'Rotenberg²⁷ would even recite "*HaMelech Hakadosh*" and "*HaMelech HaMishpat*" on *Hoshana Rabba*.]²⁸

Why is this judgment not mentioned in the Gemara?

Rav Yaakov Kamenetzky²⁹ wonders how it is possible that *Hoshana Rabba* is a great day of judgment for the entire world and yet is not mentioned in the Talmud Bavli or Talmud Yerushalmi, but only became revealed by the Zohar?

Rav Yaakov answers by explaining that as the generations get weaker, it is necessary for more hidden concepts to be revealed to gain a better appreciation. In earlier generations it was not necessary to reveal the seriousness of this day, for on the contrary had it been revealed it would have detracted too much from the Simchas Yom Tov, so they hid this from the masses. However, in our generation when the 'fear of judgment' is not as strong it was beneficial to reveal the seriousness of the day, and the Simchas Yom Tov would remain intact.³⁰

Staying up all night

The Magen Avraham³¹ writes that "The Jewish people have the custom to stay up the entire night of *Hoshana Rabba*."³² The Chida³³ writes that "One should try very much to stay up all of *Hoshana Rabba* night and learn since everything is determined by the conclusion, and this is the time when one's judgment is concluded. Thus, a person should strengthen himself during the night of *Hoshana Rabba*, and the daytime, to serve Hashem and do Teshuva, as Hashem does not forsake those who serve Him with sincerity!"

Mishna Torah. The Aruch haShulchan³⁴ writes that it is customary to recite Mishna Torah (Sefer Devarim³⁵) at night. There are several reasons given for this custom:

1. The Aruch haShulchan³⁶ writes that reading Mishna Torah is the ideal way to instill the love of Hashem and fear of Hashem within oneself.
2. Sefer Nigid u'Mitzvah³⁷ explains that "just as the *mitzvos* ("the *Dinim*") are written in the first four books of the Torah and then repeated in Mishna Torah, so too on *Hoshana Rabba*, the judgment ("Din") is sealed for the second time and is given over to the messengers to be sent out. This is the secret of *Hoshana Rabba*."

Minchas Yitzchak³⁸ writes that "many communities have the custom to recite Mishna Torah from a *Sefer Torah*, and this is strongly founded on great mountains." Although in general we do not take out a *Sefer Torah* to be read publicly without reciting a *beracha* first,³⁹ in this case it is permissible because the *Sefer Torah* is not being removed for a 'communal reading' but rather to be *learnt* from in public.⁴⁰

Reciting Tehillim. The Aruch haShulchan⁴¹ writes that it is also customary to recite the entire Tehillim on *Hoshana Rabba*, and upon its completion to recite a special *Yehi Ratzon* for the day for *Hoshana Rabba*. The Kaf Hachaim⁴² writes from the *Arizal* that on the night of *Hoshana Rabba*, before *chatzos* one should read Mishna Torah⁴³ and after *chatzos* one should recite the entire Tehillim.⁴⁴

Learning during the daytime. Yesod v'Shores haAvoda⁴⁵ writes that by the daytime of *Hoshana Rabba* as well "one must be extremely careful not to waste his time idly, as the *Arizal* wrote 'During the daytime of *Hoshana Rabba* as well one should be careful to add more Torah learning for it is at this time that the judgment is given over to the messengers.' Therefore, after one's meal he should spend his time learning. If one needs to take a nap, he should appoint a *shomer* to wake him up to ensure that he has enough time to get ready for Yom Tov and daven Mincha with a *minyan*. One should not be like the many people who come late to Mincha on *Hoshana Rabba*, and sometimes even daven alone in their home rushing through davening, as this is an awesome day."

Circling the Bima Seven times

The Shulchan Aruch⁴⁶ writes that we circle the *bima* seven times in prayer⁴⁷ just as in the Bais Hamikdash they circled the Mizbeich seven times.⁴⁸ Yesod v'Shores haAvoda⁴⁹ writes that "there are great and wonderful things which occur in the holy upper worlds through the circling of the bimah seven times and reciting *Hoshanos*."⁵⁰

Part 2: The Day of The Arava

The Levush⁵¹ explains that we call this day "*Hoshana Rabba*" because on this day we spend much time davening with the *Hoshanos* (Aravos).

The Mishna Berura⁵² explains that in the times of the Bais Hamikdash, there was a *halacha l'Moshe mi'Sinai* to take a tall *aravos* and place them around the sides of the Mizbeich and afterwards the people would take them and waive them. On *Hoshana Rabba*, they would circle the Mizbeich seven times as well. After the Bais Hamikdash was destroyed the Nevim established a *minhag* to take the *aravos* (*hoshanos*) on the day of *Hoshana Rabba*.⁵³ Since taking the *arava* is only a *minhag* we do not recite a *beracha* on it.⁵⁴

The minhag of Hoshanos – Two opinions

The Gemara⁵⁵ states that the *minhag* is "to be הובות ה^הoshanos" on *Hoshana Rabba*, yet there is a dispute amongst the Rishonim regarding how to define הובות and how to fulfill the *minhag*:

- 1) Rashi⁵⁶ explains that one must waive (ניעננע) the *aravos* (similar to the way one waves the lulav each day of Sukkos).
 - 2) The Rambam⁵⁷ explains that one must hit the *hoshanos* on the ground.
- The Shulchan Aruch⁵⁸ rules like the Rambam that one must hit the *hoshanos* on the floor. Yet, the Rema⁵⁹ adds that since Rashi rules that one must waive the *hoshanos* one should do both: first waive them and then hit them on the floor. However, the Aruch HaShulchan⁶⁰ writes that "we do not know of this custom [to waive the *hoshanos*]."⁶¹ Nevertheless, he concludes⁶² that "one should be concerned for the words of the Rema and waive the *hoshanos* a little."⁶³

The Gabbai sells Hoshanos in shul

The Rema⁶⁴ writes that the custom is for the gabbai of the shul to bring *hoshanos* to sell for the congregation just as was the custom in the Bais Hamikdash where the messengers of Bais Din would bring the *arvos*.⁶⁵

Why do we take the Hoshanos?

Chochmos Shlomo⁶⁶ writes "There are certainly deep secrets involved with the custom to take and hit the *hoshanos* on this day." The Bikurei Yaakov⁶⁷ writes that this is to hint to

the judgments on this day should be removed. Some⁶⁸ explain that we take the *aravos* which represents the lips of a person as if to say that all the evil prosecution against the Jewish people should be removed.

How many Aravos are taken?

The Shulchan Aruch⁶⁹ writes that one can technically fulfill his obligation with one *arava* branch which has even one leaf on it. However, the Rema⁷⁰ writes that in practice this should not be done as it is repulsive to have just one branch with one leaf, rather one should make beautiful *aravos* to beautify the mitzvah.

The Mishna Berura⁷¹ writes that “[*l’chatchila* one should take at least three *aravos*,⁷² but the *Arizal* writes that one should take five *aravos* [corresponding to the five גבורות (strengths)].”

Who is required to fulfill this minhag?

Women. Although women are exempt from this custom (as it is a *zman gerama*), nevertheless, the custom is for women to [recite some of the prayers of the Hoshanos and to⁷³] hit the *hoshanos* as well.⁷⁴ Additionally, since *Hoshana Rabba* is a day of judgment for women as well, they too are careful to fulfill this *minhag*.⁷⁵

Children. Once a child reaches the age of Chinuch he should certainly fulfill this *minhag*.⁷⁶ However, it is customary that all children, even those who are very young, fulfill this *minhag*.⁷⁷ Technically, one may give each child (even those who have reached the age of Chinuch) one branch to hit (as this is the requirement based on halacha), yet the custom is to provide each child (even those who are very young) with a set of five *aravos*.⁷⁸

Tying the Hoshanos in a bundle

There are two opinions regarding whether the Honashos should be tied in a bundle:

Opinion One - They are not tied in a bundle: The Magen Avraham⁷⁹ writes that “the *Ramah mi’pano* writes that the branches of *aravos* should be separate... and so too in the Sefer Asarah Maamaros he writes that one should not tie the *aravos* in a bundle.” The *minhag* of the Chasam Sofer⁸⁰ also was not to tie the *aravos* in a bundle.

Opinion Two – They are tied into a bundle: The Ramaz⁸¹ however writes that the *aravos* should be tied in a bundle.

The Mishna Berura⁸² cites both opinions and concludes that the custom follows the second opinion to tie the *aravos* in a bundle.⁸³

Using a rubber band to tie the bundle of hoshanos. The Pri Megadim⁸⁴ writes that it is preferable to use the stalk of an *arava* to wrap the *hoshanos*, because if one uses another materiel (e.g., a rubber band), it would be considered a *chatzitza* (separation) when holding the *hoshanos*.⁸⁵ One can use a rubber band to tie the *hoshanos* and tie the band higher up on the *hoshana* so that he can have room to hold onto the *hoshanos*.⁸⁶ However, the Magen Avraham⁸⁷ rules that using another materiel to tie the *hoshanos* is not considered a *chatzitza* since it is done to beautify the *hoshanos*.⁸⁸ Some have the custom to tie the *hoshanos* with a leaf of the lulav.⁸⁹

Tying the bundle oneself. The custom by many Tzadikim was to tie their own bundles of *aravos*.⁹⁰ The Sefer Yesod Yosef⁹¹ writes that “when one makes his own *Hoshanos* it is an auspicious time when he should dawn that through them Hakadosh Baruch Hu should save him from all damage and evil.” It is also a *segulah* to be answered with all good and righteous children [as the numerical value of עֲרֵבָה is equal to זרע children)].⁹² Therefore, Mekadesh Yisroel⁹³ writes that since nowadays when one buys the *hoshanos* they are already tied in a bundle, one should untie the bundle and then retie them himself.

Kosher Hoshanos

The Shulchan Aruch⁹⁴ writes that the size of the *aravos* for one’s *hoshanos* should be the same size as the *aravos* used for one’s lulav.

The Rema⁹⁵ adds that all the halachos which invalidate the *aravos* in one’s *lulav* apply to the *aravos* of one’s *hoshanos* as well. Thus, the Mishna Berura⁹⁶ writes that one must be careful:

- Not to use *hoshanos* which were stolen.
- Not to use *hoshanos* which are entirely dried out. One should preferably use *hoshanos* which are fresh but *b’dieved* if they are withered it is still kosher so long as they are not dried out.⁹⁷

Missing leaves. The Magen Avraham⁹⁸ explains that although the *hoshanos* must be kosher, this does not include the halacha of missing leaves, as the Shulchan Aruch rules that the *hoshanos* are kosher even if they have only one leave remaining. However, the Kaf Hachaim⁹⁹ writes that according to the *Arizal* one must be careful about this halacha as well as the *hoshanos* should not be missing leaves.

How many times to hit the Hoshanos

The Shulchan Aruch¹⁰⁰ writes that “one should hit the *hoshanos* two or three times.” However, the Mishna Berura¹⁰¹ cites the *Arizal*¹⁰² who writes that one should hit the *hoshanos* five times [corresponding to the five גבורות (strengths)]. We will soon discuss whether one should hit the *hoshanos* additional times so that the leaves fall off.

Where to hit the hoshanos

There are two opinions on where one should hit the *hoshanos*:

Opinion I: Based on Halacha. The Shulchan Aruch¹⁰³ writes that “one should hit the *hoshanos* on the ground or on a vessel (e.g., a chair or table¹⁰⁴).”

Opinion Two: Based on Kabala. The Mishna Berura¹⁰⁵ cites the *Arizal* who says that one should specifically hit the *hoshanos* on the ground. The Zohar¹⁰⁶ writes as well that the *hoshanos* should be hit on the ground. This is because one wishes to destroy the judgment until it is no longer found and to ‘bring it down into the ground’.¹⁰⁷ The Ben Ish Chai¹⁰⁸

writes as well that “One should hit the *hoshanos* on the ground and not on the stone or wooden floor, as the ground is needed for this mitzva, and one should hit it with strength.” Sefer Rivvivos Ephraim¹⁰⁹ wonders that nowadays that our shuls have floors how can we fulfill this opinion? He cites Sefer Nisivei Am¹¹⁰ who writes that “the custom in Yerushalyim was to hit the *hoshanos* specifically on the ground which has dirt and thus they would either go outside to hit the *hoshanos* or sprinkle dirt on the floor of the shul before hitting the *hoshanos*.” [Mekadesh Yisroel¹¹¹ writes that perhaps if the shul is on the first floor he may hit the *hoshanos* on the floor since there is no air space which separates between the floor and the ground underneath it.]

Hitting the Hoshanos until the leaves fall off

There are two opinions regarding whether one should hit the *hoshanos* until all its leaves fall off:

Opinion One: Not to remove all its leaves. As we mentioned, the Shulchan Aruch writes that one should hit the *hoshanos* two or three times and makes no mention of hitting them until all the leaves fall off. The Kitzur Shulchan Aruch¹¹² writes that “We hit the *hoshanos* five times and that is sufficient even if none of the leaves fall off.” In fact, the Chayei Adam¹¹³ writes “the *minhag* to hit the *aravos* until all its leaves fall off is a custom [which is done] for the children [to keep them engaged by doing something]¹¹⁴ fun. Similarly, Sefer Mekor Chaim¹¹⁵ writes that “The unlearned people hit the *hoshanos* with much strength and for a long time until it is totally stripped of all its leaves, yet when it comes to shaking the lulav they are shake it flippantly, not being careful to in the correct manner. This is a distortion of our customs which was done by the unlearned people.” The Yavitz¹¹⁶ writes that “One should hit the *hoshanos* five times on the ground, as the Zohar states, and not less and not more than that.”

Opinion Two: To remove its leaves. The Mishna Berura¹¹⁷ writes that “It is appropriate to first hit the *hoshanos* five times on the ground and then afterwards hit it on a vessel (e.g., a chair) to remove its leaves, but one does not need to remove all of its leaves.” The Tosfos Yom Tov¹¹⁸ writes that “we hit the *hoshanos* as a way of throwing away the [harsh] judgment with all our might, and thus we hit the *hoshanos* on a vessel to remove all the leaves, all the judgment.”

Using the aravos from one’s lulav

The Shulchan Aruch¹¹⁹ writes that “one may not fulfill his obligation with the *aravos* in the lulav even if he lifts them up twice, once for the mitzva of lulav and once for the mitzva of hoshanos.¹²⁰” However, the Mishna Berura¹²¹ explains that this is only if the *aravos* are still tied together with the lulav, but if one removes the *aravos* from the lulav he may certainly use it for hoshanos. [It is permissible to remove the *aravos* from one mitzva (the lulav) to another mitzva (the hoshanos).¹²²]

Using hoshanos which were already used by another person

It is permissible to use *hoshanos* which were already used by another person,¹²³ so long as the leaves look nice (for as we discussed earlier one should *l’chatchila* use *hoshanos* that are nice looking and according to the *Arizal* are not missing most of its leaves).¹²⁴ However, if the first person follows the opinion that one must beat the *hoshanos* until the leaves fall off (אויסגעקלאפט-הושענה) then one should not use them a second time.¹²⁵

Untying the lulav

The Shulchan Aruch writes that “the custom is to untie the [top ring of the¹²⁶] lulav and then to circle the *bimah* seven times.” The Levush¹²⁷ explains that “this is done to increase one’s Simcha as when then the lulav flaps more freely it increase the joy.” The Shulchan Aruch indicates that one should untie the lulav [after Halel] before circling the *bimah* seven times.¹²⁸

The correct time to put down one’s lulav and pick up the hoshanos

The Rema¹²⁹ writes that “the custom is as follows: during Shachris one takes the lulav [alone, without the *hoshanos*¹³⁰] and the during *hakafos* as well until the time of hitting. At that time, one puts down the lulav and takes the *hoshanos* alone, preferably without the lulav.”¹³¹ The Mishna Berura¹³² adds that according to the *Shela hakadosh* one should pick up the *hoshanos* when reciting “תענה אמונים” but according to the *Arizal* one should pick up the *hoshanos* only after הקדיש תתקבל קדיש.

Placing the Hoshanos on top of the Aron Kodesh

The Shulchan Aruch¹³³ writes that after one uses the *aravos*¹³⁴ although they may be discarded, they should not be trampled on in a disgraceful manner. The Rema¹³⁵ writes that one should not discard it in the garbage in a disgraceful manner [but they should be wrapped in a plastic bag before being discarded¹³⁶]. He adds that some are accustomed to burying them, although this is not a requirement, and one who is careful with mitzvos blessing will come upon him. Although the custom nowadays is to place the *hoshanos* on top of the Aron Kodesh there is no mention in the earlier poskim about doing so.¹³⁷ Rav Moshe Shternbauch¹³⁸ suggests that this custom is done to resemble the *aravos* in the Bais Hamikdash which were placed on the sides of the *Mizbeiach* and thus the place of our Aron Kodesh is in the place of the *Mizbeiach*.

Saving the Hoshanos to be burnt on Pesach. The Rema¹³⁹ writes that some have the custom to hide the *aravos* until Pesach and use them to for firewood to bake the matzos as since a mitzva was done with them they are used for another mitzva as well. The Shulchan Aruch HaRav¹⁴⁰ writes similarly that the *aravos* should be hidden and used for burning the chametz on Pesach.¹⁴¹ However, the Aruch Hashulchan writes that “because there is a long time from Sukkos to Pesach it is likely that that the *hoshanos* will be left in a disgraceful manner, therefore it is preferable that they are burnt right away just as we burn the *s’chach* of the Sukkah (when using branches and leaves¹⁴²).

¹ 6:106:7

² Beiros Mayim, 2 p. 64

³ Ibid

⁴ Beiros Mayim, 2 p. 64

⁵ He explains that on Purim, the miracle was hidden; on erev Yom Kippur, we eat and gain forgiveness; on *Hoshana* Rabba, one can merit forgiveness for his sins.

⁶ Yeshayahu 58:2

⁷ Rosh HaShana 4:8

⁸ Yafa Mareh on Yerushalmi; Rav Chaim Kanievsky, commentary on Yerushalmi

⁹ Parshas Tzav 31b

¹⁰ *Hoshana* Rabba

¹¹ 383

¹² B'Mechitzas Rabbeinu, p. 135

¹³ Perhaps we can understand this more deeply: On Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur it is a time of judgment based on our service of Hashem with fear, yet on Sukkos the judgment is based on our service of Hashem with love and happiness (*zman Simchaseinu*); see Vilna Goan (Kol Eliyahu, Emor). Sefer Mateh Moshe (957) cites a Medresh that “Hakadosh Baruch Hu says to Avraham, I will give one day for your children to gain forgiveness, the day of *Hoshana* Rabba. My Name is אהי"ה (21) and you are born during the 21st generation and *Hoshana* Rabba is the 21st day of Tishrei, if your children do not merit forgiveness on Rosh Hashana and on Yom Kippur, they can merit forgiveness on the day of *Hoshana* Rabba. The Medresh (cited in Nefesh Hachaim 1:7) “Hashem says to Moshe: Tell the Jewish people that my name is אהי"ה אשר אהי"ה which means that the way that they are with me is the way that I am with them. If they are *happy*, then I am happy. If they are *sad*, then I am sad.” Thus, the Name of אהי"ה looks not at whether we are performing the mitzvos or not but rather how we are performing them – with joy or with sadness. This is the judgment of *Hoshana* Rabba, as if one serves Hashem with happiness then he can merit a pardon on this day!

¹⁴ 664:1

¹⁵ 664:7

¹⁶ 664:1

¹⁷ 664:9

¹⁸ **A day to celebrate as a Yom Tov.** We also find many *halachos* which indicate that *Hoshana* Rabba is a Yom Tov (on a higher level than the other days of Chol HaMoed).

❖ The Shulchan Aruch (664:1) writes that we recite additional Mizmorim just like we do on Yom Tov. The Mishna Berura (664:2) writes that we recite the additional Pesukei D'Zimra which we recite on Shabbos and Yom Tov.

[However, the Rema (664:1) writes that we do not recite Nishmas, since it is still a weekday (Mishna Berura 664:3). The Levush (664:1) adds that one's *neshma* is not as strong on *Hoshana* Rabba as it is on other Yomim Tovim. We also recite Mizmor I'Todah (Rema, ibid).]

❖ The Mishna Berura (644:2) writes that during Mussaf we recite the Kedusha which is recited on Yom Tov.

❖ The Rema (644:1) writes that the Kaddish after Mussaf is recited in a song as it is on Yom Tov.

❖ The Rema (ibid) writes that when the Sefer Torah is removed, we recite the Shema Yisroel and the other verses as we do on Yom Tov.

❖ The Aruch HaShulchan (644:13) writes that “it is customary to have a *seudas Yom Tov* on *Hoshana* Rabba with good food. If possible, one should have a nice seuda at night as well. However, it is incorrect what I have seen that many people eat so much on the day of *Hoshana* Rabba until they are not able to eat at night of Shmini Atzeres.”

❖ The Rema (644:1) writes that “we are not accustomed to performing melacha (at all, just as on Yom Tov) until after one leaves the Bais Medresh after davening. Thus, the Mishna Berura (664:5) adds that there are those that remove their wallets as well. However, the Ben Ish Chai (1, Vzoz Haberacha, 5) adds that if one is accustomed to giving Tzedaka during davening he should certainly do so on *Hoshana* Rabba as well.

❖ The Aruch HaShulchan (664:13) writes that it is customary to greet someone by saying “Good Yom Tov,” and not to greet someone as he does on an ordinary weekday.

¹⁹ 664:1

²⁰ 664:8

²¹ 664:11

²² Ibid

²³ **When does the judgment take place?** *Nigid u'Mitzvah* (*Hoshana* Rabba) writes that the main part of the judgment is during the first half of the night [of *Hoshana* Rabba]. This is why [the early commentators] write that one should look at the shadow of the moon after Chatzos at night, because at that point the main part of the judgment has already occurred. Similarly, the Chasam Sofer (Derashos, Simchas Torah, 44) writes from the *Rama m'Pano* that if one counts the hours from the start of Rosh HaShana until the sixth hour of the night (chatzos) of *Hoshana* Rabba he will find that there are 486 hours [בת"ו ומחזור] which is a hint to the verse “בית"ו ומחזור” that at the 486th hour the מחילה (forgiveness) is completed.

²⁴ 664:11

²⁵ *Hoshana* Rabba

²⁶ 664:11

²⁷ Cited in *Tiferes Shmuel* (on the Rosh, Berachos, end of the first perek)

²⁸ **Chanuka.** The Rebbe Naftali of Ropshitz (Zera Kodesh, Chanukah Leil Gimmel) writes that although the Zohar writes that the judgment is sent out on *Hoshana* Rabba, they do not have the ability to take effect until Chanukah as perhaps he will rectify what he has ruined. Rav Yosef Chaim Sonnenfeld (Noam Shabbos, p. 220) stated “There is a proof from the Gemara to what the Chasidim say that the judgment of Rosh Hashana is not carried through until Chanukah, as the Gemara (Bava Kama 112b) states that “We give a borrower ninety days to pay his debt before we write the verdict against him. There are ninety days from Rosh Hashana to Chanukah and only then is the final verdict given.”

²⁹ B'Mechitzas Rabbeinu, p. 135; Emes l'Yaakov (Vayikra 23:24)

³⁰ Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach gave the same explanation (Halichos Shlomo 12, n. 21)

³¹ Beginning of 664. The Mishna Berura 664:1 cites this as well.

³² The Mishna Berura (664:8) adds that “Regarding whether it is permissible for a husband and wife to have relations on the night of *Hoshana* Rabba, it has the same halacha as Shavuot night where only if it is the night when she comes back from the Mikva it is permitted; see Mishna Berura 240:7 and the Biur Halacha there.”

³³ Kaf Achas 24:7

³⁴ 644:11

³⁵ *Nigid u'Mitzvah*, *Hoshana* Rabba

³⁶ Ibid

³⁷ *Hoshana* Rabba

³⁸ Minchas Yitzchak 8:84:2

³⁹ Toras Refael, 2; Maharam Shick O.C., 61)

⁴⁰ Minchas Yitzchak, ibid; Kovetz Halachos, Sukkah p. 410

⁴¹ 644:11

⁴² 664:3

⁴³ The adds that if one completes Mishna Torah before chatzos he should learn Torah or Kabbalah but nothing else (i.e., not Torah she'baal peh; Pituchei Chosem).

⁴⁴ It is permissible to recite Tehillim before chatzos on *Hoshana* Rabba night (Mekadesh Yisroel, 578)

⁴⁵ Sha'ar ha'eison, 15

⁴⁶ 664:1

⁴⁷ The Shulchan Aruch writes that on this day we are judged on water and thus we recite many prayers for water.

⁴⁸ Mishna Berura 664:10

⁴⁹ Sha'ar ha'eison, 15

⁵⁰ The custom is to remove all of the Sifrei Torah on *Hoshana* Rabba when circling the bimah (see Mekadesh Yisroel 594-2)

⁵¹ 664:1

⁵² 664:11

⁵³ Tur 664:1; Mishna Berura 664:12

⁵⁴ Shulchan Aruch 664:2

⁵⁵ Sukkah 44b

⁵⁶ D'h Chavut Chavut

⁵⁷ 7:22

⁵⁸ 664:4

⁵⁹ 664:4

⁶⁰ 664:3

⁶¹ Rav Shmuel Kamenetzky (Kovetz Halachos 43:7, n. 8) writes that “We have never heard of anyone waiving the hoshanos.”

⁶² 664:7

⁶³ Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach would shake the hoshanos a little but was not careful to waive them in all directions (Halichos Shlomo 12, n. 22).

⁶⁴ 664:2

⁶⁵ Mekadesh Yisroel (581) is unsure whether there is an obligation to specifically buy *hoshanos* from one's shul or he may buy from other merchants as well. He concludes that if other merchants are selling for a cheaper price or are selling nicer *hoshanos* one may certainly buy there.

⁶⁶ On Shulchan Aruch 664:2

⁶⁷ 664:15

⁶⁸ Teshuvos Hageonim, Teshuva 340

⁶⁹ 664:4

⁷⁰ 664:4

⁷¹ 664:16

⁷² To comply with the opinion of Rav Nachman (cited in the Gemara Sukkah 44b) who holds that one must have three *aravos* (Sha'ar Hatzion 664:11).

⁷³ Kovetz Halachos 43:9

⁷⁴ Mekadesh Yisroel, 590

⁷⁵ Ibid

⁷⁶ Mekadesh Yisroel, 591

⁷⁷ Rav Chaim Kanievsky (Arbah Haminim k'hilchasom 8, n. 31)

⁷⁸ Mekadesh Yisroel, 592

⁷⁹ 664:8

⁸⁰ Minhagei haChasam Sofer 8:17

⁸¹ Cited in the Birkei Yosef 644:2

⁸² 644:17

⁸³ The Aruch HaShulchan (664:7) writes this way as well.

⁸⁴ Eishel Avraham 664:4

⁸⁵ This was the minhag of the Satmar Rebbe (machzor Divrei Yoel, *Hoshana* Rabba, 6)

⁸⁶ Bikurei Yaakov (664:11)

⁸⁷ 664:4

⁸⁸ The Mishna Berura (664:20) writes that this is the opinion of the Shulchan Aruch as well.

⁸⁹ See Magen Avraham ibid where he discusses tying the *hoshanos* with the leaf of a lulav. See Minhag Yisroel Torah 664:9

⁹⁰ See Mekadesh Yisroel 582

⁹¹ Perek 78

⁹² Mekadesh Yisroel, ibid

⁹³ Ibid

⁹⁴ 664:4

⁹⁵ 664:4

⁹⁶ 664:18

⁹⁷ Mishna Berura, ibid

⁹⁸ 664:5

⁹⁹ 664:34

¹⁰⁰ 664:4

¹⁰¹ 664:19

¹⁰² In Sha'ar Hakavanos, Derush 8 in Sukkos

¹⁰³ 664:4

¹⁰⁴ Mekadesh Yisroel, 586

¹⁰⁵ 664:19

¹⁰⁶ Tzav daf 32a

¹⁰⁷ Masas Binyamin, Chidushei Dinim at the end of the Sefer, 7

¹⁰⁸ I, Vzoz Haberacha, 7

¹⁰⁹ 5:41 I

¹¹⁰ 664:4

¹¹¹ 686

¹¹² 138:3

¹¹³ 153:3

¹¹⁴ As explained by Mekadesh Yisroel, 584, as he compares this to reading some of the verses in the Megilla out loud to keep the children engaged.

¹¹⁵ From the author of the Chavos Yair

¹¹⁶ Siddur haYavitz

¹¹⁷ 664:19

¹¹⁸ Malbushei Yom Tov 664:I

¹¹⁹ 664:6

¹²⁰ The Shulchan Aruch brings an opinion that one can indeed fulfill the minhag if he picks the aravos up twice. However, the Shulchan Aruch does not follow this opinion since he cites it as a "yeish omrim".

¹²¹ 664:21

¹²² Kovetz Halachos 43:3, n. 3

¹²³ Kovetz Halachos 43:2

¹²⁴ Mekadesh Yisroel, 583

¹²⁵ Ibid

¹²⁶ Be'er Hagolah (on the Shulchan Aruch) from the Rokeiach

¹²⁷ 664:I

¹²⁸ Kovetz Halachos 43:6. The Siddur Hayavetz writes this way as well. However, the Chazon Ish (Orchos Rabbeinu 3:45) would untie the lulav before Hallel as during Hallel one waives the lulav. The Chasam Sofer would already untie his lulav during the night of Hoshana Rabba

(Minhagei Chasam Sofer 8:10) [based on the derasha (cited in the Levush) that the Torah states כפת without a ך to teach us that for six days the lulav should be tied but on the seventh day it should be untied.

¹²⁹ 664:7

¹³⁰ Mishna Berura 460:8

¹³¹ Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (Halichos Shlomo 12:5) would hold the hoshanos upwards so that they were held "derech gedulasom" the way they grow.

¹³² 460:8

¹³³ 664:8

¹³⁴ The Shulchan Aruch is discussing the arvos of the lulav but the Mishna Berura (664:28)

writes that the same applies to the aravos of the hoshanos.

¹³⁵ The Rema here (664:8) directs to look at what he writes in siman 21:I regarding Tzitzis, where he states that one may not discard the Tzitzis in the garbage in a disgraceful manner.

¹³⁶ Mekadesh Yisroel, 594

¹³⁷ Some say that this custom emerged from the wording of the Tosfos Yom Tov (Malbushei Yom Tov 664:I) where he writes that "The Zohar explains that the meaning behind the hoshanos is to show that we hit away the evil judgments and the take the remainers of the hoshanos, which are the remainders of the judgment, and throw them on the ledges of the Bais Hamedresh (where they will no longer be found)." However, Mekadesh Yisroel (594) writes that this does not apply to the top of the Aron Kodesh where the hoshanos are seen. Thus, he suggests that perhaps this custom emerged because people did not want to leave the hoshanos on the floor in a disgraceful manner and thus placed them on top of the Aron Kodesh. However, he concludes that this will not be helpful if after davening the aravos are taken and disposed of in the garbage.

¹³⁸ 2:131, n. 4

¹³⁹ 664:9

¹⁴⁰ 445:12

¹⁴¹ Similarly, Orchos Chaim (Gimmel Seudos) writes that one should use the hadasim of his lulav for besamim on Motzai Shabbos.

¹⁴² Mekadesh Yisroel, 594